RECEIVED

NOV 2 3 1992

Before the FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION Washington, D.C. 20554

FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION
OFFICE OF THE SECRETARY

In the Matter of

Rules and Regulations Implementing) the Telephone Consumer Protection) Act of 1991

CC Docket No. 92-90 ORIGIN

PETITION FOR CLARIFICATION OR RECONSIDERATION

U S WEST Communications, Inc. ("USWC"), through counsel and pursuant to the Federal Communications Commission's ("Commission" or "FCC") Rule 1.429, hereby petitions for clarification or reconsideration of two aspects of the Commission's Report and Order ("TCPA Order"), in the above-captioned docket.

The subject matters of this Petition are: (1) a transport/network/broadcast provider's liability for compliance with the Telephone Consumer Protection Act of 1991 ("TCPA"), and the Commission's implementing rules and regulations, when the provider is not the originator or controller of the content of the call or message; and (2) the need for an intermediate transport/network/broadcast provider to "re-identify" itself to a recipient of a facsimile message, when the provider did not originate or control the content of the message.

No. of Copies rec'd 0+5 List A B C D E

¹47 C.F.R. § 1.429.

²Report and Order, FCC 92-443, rel. Oct. 16, 1992.

³47 C.F.R. §§ 64.1200, 68.318(c).

I. TRANSPORT PROVIDER LIABILITY

At two places in the Commission's <u>TCPA Order</u>, the Commission discusses the liability of a "carrier" for the messages/transmissions authored by another. The Commission should clarify that its holding was not restricted to "carriers," as that term has historically been defined by the FCC and understood by those in the telecommunications industry. Rather, the Commission should make clear that its finding was meant to encompass "service providers that merely transmit the message to its destination and do not determine content or distribution." We believe that such an articulation actually comports with what the Commission meant to convey when it agreed with certain commentors raising the issue of such service provider liability.

The matter of service provider liability for messages held unlawful under the TCPA, or the Commission's correspondent rules, was raised by a number of filing parties, both with regard to facsimile broadcast services and voice messaging services. <u>Few</u> of those commenting parties posed the issue as one involving "carrier's" liability, and only one -- Pacific Bell -- mentioned

 $^{^{4}}$ See TCPA Order at n.83 and ¶ 54.

⁵In reply, this was how the American Telephone and Telegraph Company ("AT&T") suggested the matter should be phrased. Reply Comments of AT&T, filed herein June 25, 1992, at 9.

⁶See <u>TCPA Order</u> at ¶ 54, wherein the Commission stated, "[w]e concur with these commenters."

⁷See, e.g., Comments of Bell Atlantic Telephone Companies ("Bell Atlantic"), filed herein May 26, 1992, at 3-4 (where it (continued...)

"common carrier."8

In addition to Bell Atlantic and Pacific Bell, other parties commenting on this issue were: Southern New England Telephone Company ("SNET"), Sprint Corporation ("Sprint") and (in reply) AT&T. SNET talked about a transport provider's liability in the context of an "unregulated activity" involving facsimile transmissions; Sprint discussed the matter in the context of facsimile broadcast service providers and enhanced services; Bell Atlantic discussed the concept within the confines of voice messaging services and with regard to a "carrier or other person who simply provides the transport or storage of the message; Pacific Bell discussed certain liability issues with regard to "intermediary message handlers"; 2 and AT&T discussed the matter

⁷(...continued)
argues that, under the TCPA, neither a "carrier or other person"
should be liable for mere transmission or storage of unlawful
messages). <u>Compare</u> Comments of Pacific Bell and Nevada Bell
("Pacific" or "Pacific Bell"), filed herein May 26, 1992 at 5.

While the Commission stated that the commenting parties urged it "to clarify that <u>carriers</u> who simply provide transmission facilities that are used to transmit others' unsolicited facsimile advertisements may not be held liable for any violations of § 64.1200(a)(3)[,]" (<u>TCPA Order</u> at ¶ 54 (emphasis added)), a perusal of the comments demonstrates that the request went beyond a declaration regarding carriers or carrier services.

⁸Comments of Pacific at 6.

⁹Comments of SNET, filed herein May 26, 1992, at 8.

¹⁰ Comments of Sprint, filed herein May 26, 1992, at 10-11.

¹¹ Comments of Bell Atlantic at 3-4.

¹² Comments of Pacific at 6.

within the context of "service providers that merely transmit the message to its destination and do not determine content or distribution." 13

In response to these commentors, in two separate places in the <u>TCPA Order</u>, the FCC mentions the non-liability of "carriers" with regard to the "content of messages transmitted through the network." The first reference is to voice messaging services; the second to the underlying distributors of facsimile messages.

With regard to the voice messaging discussion, the

Commission indicates that the caller (meaning the party

originating the content or the "author") is responsible for

ensuring compliance with the TCPA and the Commission's rules, not

¹³Reply Comments of AT&T at 9.

¹⁴TCPA Order at n.83 (voice messaging) and ¶ 54 (facsimile services). Footnote 83 quotes from Senator Hollings' remarks, cited above. <u>See</u> n.4 <u>supra</u>. Those remarks, in full, read as follows:

Finally, I want to clarify how this bill applies to carriers who might unknowingly transmit calls made in violation of this bill. It is not our intention that a carrier should be held liable for transmitting over the carrier's network any call or message in violation of this legislation made by an entity other than the carrier. This intention is consistent with our policy that carriers should not be responsible for the content of messages delivered over their networks. If carriers were held responsible for such transmissions, they might be forced to monitor telephone conversations, which would not be in the public interest. To the extent carriers are responsible for initiating or placing telephone calls or messages, however, they must comply with the terms of the bill.

¹⁷⁸ Cong. Rec. S18785 (Nov. 27, 1991).

Senator Hollings' remarks on the floor were not as generic as those reflected in the Senate Report discussed below at note 17.

the voice messaging service provider. The Commission cites to certain remarks of Senator Hollings in the Congressional Record, wherein the Senator discusses "carrier" liability under the TCPA. Likewise, the Commission's footnote references "the carriers providing the services[.]" 16

We believe that the use of the word "carriers" by the Commission was probably inadvertent, since the context of the discussion involved enhanced services, services not offered by telephone companies -- or others -- in a "carrier" capacity. Indeed, there is legislative history support for the proposition that Congress did not intend for service providers generally -- not just carriers -- to be held responsible for compliance or noncompliance with the Communications Act. 17

Thus, U S WEST requests that the Commission make clear that
-- in conformity with the legislative history of the TCPA -- a

¹⁵ See TCPA Order at n.83. See the full text of Senator Hollings' remarks at n.14 supra. In addition to these comments of Senator Hollings, similar remarks can be found in Senate Report 178 ("The telephone companies usually do not know when their lines are being used for telemarketing purposes, and, even if they did, it is questionable whether the telephone companies should be given the responsibility of preventing such calls by monitoring conversations."). S. Rep. No. 178, 102nd Cong. 1 Sess. (1991), 1-2. See also S. Rep. No. 177, 102nd Cong., 1 Sess. (1991), at 2 to the same effect.

¹⁶TCPA Order at n.83.

¹⁷In Senate Report 178 it is stated, "[t]he regulations concerning the use of these machines apply to the persons initiating the telephone call or sending the message and do not apply to the common carrier or other entity that transmits the call or message and that is not the originator or controller of the content of the call or message." S. Rep. No. 178, 102nd Cong., 1 Sess. (1991), at 9 (emphasis added).

voice messaging provider is not responsible for its participation in delivering (or later "making a call" through a broadcast mode, for example) a prerecorded or artificial voice message that does not comply with the TCPA or the Commission's rules. 18

The Commission should provide the same kind of clarification with regard to facsimile platform/broadcast providers. The parties commenting on facsimile services during the course of the proceedings did not generally describe their activities as carrier activities; nor did they request a clarification of liability with regard to carrier services. They described enhanced services.

Given the fact that the Commission generally "concurred" with the positions of the filing parties, 19 it should clarify that its concurrence goes beyond "carrier liability" to "service provider liability." It is clear that Congress did not intend for such intermediate transmission entities to be liable under the TCPA. Thus, acting in its expert agency capacity, the Commission should make this clear; and make clear that such service providers have no liability under the Commission's rules

¹⁸Such non-compliance calls might include a commercial call sent to a residential line by a business with whom the resident has no prior business relations, which is "broadcast" by the voice messaging service provider; or a call to an emergency line or health facility without the prior express consent of the entity.

¹⁹See <u>TCPA Order</u> at ¶ 54.

either.20

II. REQUIRED IDENTIFICATIONS FOR FACSIMILE TRANSMISSIONS

The purpose of the facsimile identification portion of the TCPA was to prevent the sending of "junk faxes," with attendant cost and "down time," to unreceptive recipients. This purpose can clearly be satisfied by requiring only that the author of the message identify its business and sending telephone number. In this way, if the author of the message sends a prohibited message, e.g., an unsolicited advertisement, the recipient has knowledge of whom to contact or complain to. There is no need for the intermediate facsimile broadcast provider to "reidentify" the authoring party or itself.

The Commission should clarify that under Section 227(d)(1)(B) of the TCPA, and its proposed Rule 68.318(c), the

²⁰The legislative history can be read to reflect a position of "no liability" at all. But for Senator Hollings' singular reference to "unknowing" transmissions in his remarks quoted at n.14 <u>supra</u>, the legislative history generally demonstrates a focus on telemarketers and manufacturers. Telemarketers are required to do certain things and refrain from doing other things; manufacturers are required to manufacture equipment in conformity with certain standards.

In the Commission's analysis of this matter, however, it framed a certain standard of "carrier" liability. See TCPA Order at ¶ 54. We would urge the Commission to reconsider its remarks about "carrier" liability, as well. The better course, we believe, is to find that under this legislation Congress intended no liability for intermediate transport providers.

If the Commission does not find such an interpretation satisfactory, then we urge it to adopt the same liability standard for service providers under the TCPA and the Commission's corresponding rules as it previously pronounced for carriers.

"identification" that occurs (<u>i.e.</u>, the date/time identification, as well as the identification of the business or other entity "sending" the facsimile message) is the <u>author</u> of the message content and <u>not</u> an intermediate facsimile transport/broadcast provider. In light of the legislative history discussed above, the Commission should make clear that the transport/broadcast provider -- who exerts no control over the origination of the message content -- has no compliance obligations.

III. CONCLUSION

On the basis of the above, USWC requests that the Commission declare that transport providers who carry facsimile or voice messages deemed unlawful under the TCPA, have no or limited liability for such transmissions. Furthermore, we request that the Commission clarify that only the author of an

²¹Bell Atlantic has asked for such a ruling in its initial comments. <u>See</u> Comments of Bell Atlantic at 4.

originating facsimile message need comply with the identification requirements found in Section 227(d) and the Commission's proposed Rule 68.318(c).

Respectfully submitted,

U S WEST Communications, Inc.

By:

Stuart'S. Gunckel
Laurie J. Bennett
Kathryn Marie Krause
1020 19th Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20036
(202) 129-0303

(202) 429-0303

Its Attorneys

November 23, 1992

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Kelseau Powe, Jr., do hereby certify on this 23rd day of November, 1992, that I have caused a copy of the foregoing **PETITION FOR CLARIFICATION OR RECONSIDERATION** to be served, via first class United States mail, postage prepaid, to the persons named on the attached service list.

Kelseau Powe, Jr.

*Cheryl A. Tritt, Chief Common Carrier Bureau Federal Communications Commission 1919 M Street, N.W. Room 500 Washington, D.C. 20554 Morton H. Halperin Robert S. Peck Janlori Goldman ACLU 122 Maryland Ave., N.E. Washington, D.C. 20002

*James R. Keegan, Chief Domestic Facilities Division Federal Communications Commission 2025 M Street, N.W. Room 6010 Washington, D.C. 20554 Edward C. Miller
American Council of Life
Insurance
1001 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20004-2599

*Abraham A. Leib, Chief Domestic Services Branch Federal Communications Commission 2025 M Street, N.W. Room 6010 Washington, D.C. 20554 John W. Tadlock III
ALPHA Information
Services, Inc.
1720 E. University Avenue
Oxford, MS 38655

*Olga-Madruga-Forti
Domestic Services Branch
Federal Communications
Commission
2025 M Street, N.W.
Room 6010
Washington, D.C. 20554

Thomas C. Franks
American Resort Development
Association
1220 L Street, N.W.
Suite 510
Washington, D.C. 20005

*Downtown Copy Center Federal Communications Commission 1919 M Street, N.W. Room 246 Washington, D.C. 20554 Mary Ann Dirzis AVON Nine West 57th Street New York, NY 10019 Daniel L. Jaffe
Association of
National Advertising, Inc.
1725 K Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20006

Dirk C. Bloemendaal Amway Corporation 7575 Fulton Street East Ada, MI 49355-7410

John F. Sturm
American Newspaper Publishers
Association
Box 17407 Dulles Airport
Washington, D.C. 20041

Ronald G. Doster A/R Services One Jackson Square P.O. Box 3500 Jackson, MI 49204-3500

Richard E. Wiley Michael Yourshaw Thomas W. Kirby Wiley, Rein & Fielding 1776 K Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20006 David D. Wierman Ann Arbor News 340 East Huron Street Ann Arbor, MI 49106-1147

Basil J. Mezines Stein, Mitchell & Mezines 1100 Connecticut Ave., N.W. Suite 1100 Washington, D.C. 20036 Gary Berkley Belleville News-Democrat 120 South Illinois Street Belleville, IL 62220

Larry Fuller Argus Leader 200 South Minnesota Avenue Box 5034 Sioux Falls, SD 57117-5034 Francine J. Berry
David P. Condit
American Telephone
and Telegraph Company
295 North Maple Avenue
Room 3244J1
Basking Ridge, NJ 07920

Floyd S. Keene
Pamela J. Andrews
Ameritech Operating
Company
Room 4H94
2000 W. Ameritech Center Dr.
Hoffman Estates, IL 60196

David S. Dickson The Baltimore Sun 501 North Calvert Street P.O. Box 1377 Baltimore, MD 21278-0001

James S. Blaszak Kevin S. DiLallo Gardner, Carton & Douglas 1301 K Street, N.W. Suite 900 Washington, D.C. 20005 John M. Goodman
Lawrence W. Katz
Bell Atlantic Telephone
Companies
1710 H Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20006

Philip S. Corwin American Bankers Association 1120 Connecticut Ave., N.W. Washington, D.C. 20036 William B. Barfield A. Kirven Gilbert III BellSouth Corporation 1155 Peachtree Street, N.E. Suite 1800 Atlanta, GA 30367-6000

Janet H. Buchan Robert R.C. Buchan 404 South Plum Street Troy, OH 45373 Diane S. Killory
Debra L. Lagapa
Robert G. Ballen
Morrison & Foerster
2000 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20006

David A. Brune
Baltimore Gas &
Electric Center
Charles Center
P.O. Box 1475
Baltimore, MD 21203

Amy N. Lipton CUC International Inc. 707 Summer Street Stamford, CT 06904-2049 Douglas L. Parker
Institute of Public
Representation
Georgetown University Law
Center
600 New Jersey Ave., N.W.
Suite 312
Washington, D.C. 20001

Timothy O. White New York's Capital News Papers News Plaza Box 15000 Albany, NY 12212

Stepsen M. Nelson Community Benefits Corporation 1109 N. Thompson Street Richmond, VA 23230 Blake L. Sanderson The Daily News 718 Poplar Street P.O. Box 600 Lebanon, PA 17042

Louis Gurman
Coleen M. Egan
Gurman, Kurtis, Blask
& Freeman
1400 16th Street, N.W.
Suite 500
Washington, D.C. 20036

John J. Gavin
D. F. King & Co.
77 Water Street
New York, NY 10005

William Weller
Laura McMcluer
Digital Systems
International, Inc.
6464 185th Avenue, N.E.
Redmond, WA 98052-5032

Pipes Gaines
Daily News
P.O. Box 90012
Bowling Green, KY 42101-9012

Daniel E. Lungren
Herschel T. Elkins
Department of Justice
300 South Spring Street
Suite 5212
Los Angeles, CA 90013

D. Keith Hancock Direct Selling Association 1776 K Street, N.W. Suite 600 Washington, D.C. 20006 Richard J. McClennen Detroit Newspaper Association 615 W. Lafayette Blvd. Detroit, MI 48226 J. C. Hickman
The Bellingham Herald
1155 State Street
P.O. Box 1277
Bellingham, WA 98227

Ian D. Volner
Allan R. Adler
Cohn & Marks
Suite 600
1333 New Hampshire Ave., N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20036

Arthur E. Mayhew Bucks County Courier Times 8400 Route 13 Levittown, PA 19057

Chuck Schussman
Daily News
P.O. Box 4200
Woodland Hills, CA 91365-4200

Ken McEldowney Consumer Action 116 New Montgomery Street Suite 223 San Francisco, CA 94105

Jodi Meryl Wallace Electronic Information Systems, Inc. 1351 Washington Blvd. Stamford, CT 06902 Theordore D. Frank
Vonya B. McCann
Arent, Fox, Kintner, Plotkin
& Kahn
1050 Connecticut Ave., N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20036-5339

Rhonda L. Koprowski
Blue Cross &
Blue Shield
401 West Michigan Street
P.O. Box 2025
Milwaukee, WI 53201-2035

Charles Corporation Charles F. Wright Centel Corporation 8725 Higgins Road Chicago, Il 60631 Michael Altschul
Jack W. Whitley
Cellular Telecommunication
Industry Association
1133 21st, N.W.
Suite 300
Washington, D.C. 20036

Brenda L. Fox
Peter H. Feinberg
Dow, Lohnes & Albertson
1255 23rd Street, N.W.
Suite 500
Washington, D.C. 20037

Cheryl Issod Centre Daily Times P.O. Box 89 State College, PA 16804

Gary Hauser
Coalition of Higher
Education Assistance
Organization
1101 Vermont Avenue, N.W.
Suite 400
Washington, D.C. 20005-3521

James L. Dimmitt Chico Enterprise Record 400 East Park Avenue P.O. Box 9 Chico, CA 95927-0009

Don D. Davidson
CUNA Mutual
Insurance Group
5910 Mineral Point Road
P.O. Box 391
Madison, WI 53701-0391

Peter Arth, Jr. Edward W. O'Neill California PUC 505 Van Ness Avenue San Francisco, CA 94102 William C. Marcil Forum Publishing Co. Box 2020 Fargo, ND 58107

P. Michael Nugent Patrick D. Hadley Citicorp 425 Park Avenue 2nd Floor/Zone 6 New York, NY 10043 Daniel L. Bart GTE Service Corporation Suite 1200 1850 M Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20036

Peter D. O'Connell Kathleen A. Kirby Reed, Smith, Shaw & McClay 1200 18th Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20036 Maury S. Kauffman The Kauffman Group 324 Windsor Drive Cherry Hill, NJ 08002

A. Thomas Carroccio Edward J. Smith Santarelli, Smith & Carroccio 555 13th Street, N.W. 1155 Connecticut Ave., N.W. Ninth Floor Washington, D.C. 20036

Peter A. Rohrbach Hogan & Hartson Washington, D.C. 20004

Brian R. Moir Fisher, Wayland, Cooper & Leader 1255 23rd Street, N.W. Suite 800 Washington, D.C. 20037-1170 Douglas E. Neel MessagePhone, Inc. 5910 N. Central Expressway Suite 1575 Dallas, TX 75206

John F. Dodd Brad I. Pearson Smith, Gill, Fisher & Butts One Kansas City Place 1200 Main Street, N.W. 35th Floor Kansas City, MO 64105-2152 Mary J. Sisak Donald J. Elardo MCI Telecommunications Corporation 1801 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W. Washington, D.C. 20006

Lelly K. Korszik Winstead, Sechrest & Minick 5400 Renaissance Tower 1201 Elm Street Dallas, TX 75270

James R. Cooke Harris, Beach & Wilcox Suite 1000 1611 North Kent Street Arlington, VA 22209

Daniel Brenner
Dean Hansell
LeBoeuf, Lamb, Leiby
& MacRae
725 South Figueroa Street
Suite 3600
Los Angeles, CA 90017-5436

Mark Sinz The New York Times 229 West 43 Street New York, NY 10036

Steven H. Gittelman Mktg. Incorporated 200 Carleton Avenue East Islip, NY 11730 Michael J. Altier National Retail Federation 701 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W. Suite 710 Washington, D.C. 20004

Henry J. Spring
Pitney Bowes
World Headquarters
Loc 61-21
Stamford, CT 06926-0700

Bob Bergland
National Rural Electric
Cooperative Association
1800 Massachusetts Ave., N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20036

Robert S. Bulmash Private Citizens, Inc. P.O. Box 233 Naperville, IL 60566 Mary McDermott Carlos J. Sandoval NYNEX Corporation 120 Bloomingdale Road White Plains, NY 10605

Bruce E. Thompson, Jr.
Merrill Lynch and Company
3000 K Street, N.W.
Suite 620
Washington, D.C. 20007

William J. Cowan
New York Dept. of Public
Service
Three Empire State Plaza
Albany, NY 12223

Stephen D. Driesier
National Association
of Realtors
777 14th Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20005-3271

Lee Fisher
James B. Gainer
Public Utilities Commission
of Ohio
180 E. Broad Street
Columbus, OH 43266-0573

Albert H. Kramer Robert F. Aldrich Keck, Mahin & Cate 1201 New York Ave., N.W. Penthouse Suite Washington, D.C. 20005 Fred A. Stickel Oregonian Publishing Company Portland, OR 97201

John F. Barker Linda F. Golodner Suite 928N 815 15th Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20005

James B. Miller Pacesetter Corporation 4343 South 96th Street Omaha, NE 68127

David Cosson
L. Marie Guillory
National Telephone Cooperative
Association
2626 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20037

James P. Tuthill
Nancy C. Woolf
Pacific\Nevada Bell
140 New Montgomery Street
Room 1523
San Francisco, CA 94105

James B. Groff NAWC Suite 1212 1725 K Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20006-1401 James L. Wurtz
Pacific\Nevada Bell
1275 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20004

Jay C. Keithley
Leon Kestenbaum
Sprint Corporation
1850 M Street, N.W.
Suite 1100
Washington, D.C. 20036

Durward D. Dupre
Richard C. Hartgrove
Southwestern Bell Telephone
Company
1010 Pine Street
Room 2114
St. Louis, MO 63101

W. Richard Morris Sprint Corporation P.O. Box 11315 Kansas City, MO 64112 Thomas A. Stroup Telecator 1019 19th Street, N.W. Suite 1100 Washington, D.C. 20036

Andrew D. Lipman
Swidler & Berlin
3000 K Street, N.W.
Suite 300
Washington, D.C. 20007

Aaron I. Fleischman Charles S. Walsh Fleischman and Walsh 1400 16th Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20036

Randolph H. Aires Sears, Roebuck and Co. Sears House 633 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W. Suite 600 Washington, D.C. 20004

Michael J. Tamer Teknekron Infoswitch Corporation 4425 Cambridge Road Ft. Worth, TX 76155

Linda Hershman
Southern New England
Telephone Company
227 Church Street
New Haven, CT 06506

Ashton Phelps, Jr. The Times Picayune 3800 Howard Avenue New Orleans, LA 70140-1097 Martin T. McCue Linda Kent United States Telephone Association 900 19th Street, N.W. Suite 800 Washington, D.C. 20006-2105 John W. Pettit
Thomas K. Crowe
Hopkins & Sutter
888 16th Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20006

Jeffrey L. Sheldon
Mara J. Promosch
Utilities Telecommunications
Council
1140 Connecticut Ave., N.W.
Suite 1140
Washington, D.C. 20036

Stephen G. Kraskin
Brain D. Robinson
Blooston, Mordkofsky, Jackson
& Dickens
2120 L Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20037

Bill K. Brewster Congress of the United States House of Representatives Washington, D.C. 20515-3603

Mark D. Bergman Contractors Clearing House P.O. Box 12515 Ogden, UT 84412-2515